685 Third Avenue New York, NY 10017

Tel: (212) 503-6300

Date: January 18, 2018

To: The File of the Hugh L. Carey Battery Park City Authority

From: Tailored Technologies, LLC

Technology Observations and Recommendations Resulting From the October 31, 2016 Audit

Marks Paneth LLP has issued a management letter under AU-C Section 265 indicating they did not observe any material weaknesses. The memo below represents our observations that are either minor in nature or represent best practices pertaining to technology. Matters in this memo are as of the date of this letter. If matters should arise between this date and the date of Marks Paneth LLP's audit report on the financial statements, we will update this memo.

Table of Contents

OVERVIEW	2
CYBERSECURITY	3

Exhibit I - Current Year Recommendations

There are no new observations and recommendations for the current year.

Exhibit II – Prior Year Observations Requiring Further Attention

There are no prior year observations and recommendations which require further attention.

Exhibit III - Prior Year Recommendations That Appear Not to Require Further Action

Data Restore Testing

OVERVIEW

On January 12, 2018, Marks Paneth LLP's Tailored Technologies met with the following individuals:

- 1. Benjamin Jones, Acting President and Chief Administrative Officer
- 2. Pamela Frederick, Chief Financial Officer
- 3. John Tam, Director of IT
- 4. Karl Koenig, Controller
- 5. Jason Rachnowitz, Director of Financial Reporting
- 6. Robert Quon, Deputy Director of IT
- 7. Marie Corneille, Deputy Treasurer
- 8. Neresa Gordon, Network Security Manager
- 9. Siu Ng, Senior Programmer Analyst
- 10. Leandro Lafuente, Senior Systems Administrator

Our examination was performed in conjunction with the Hugh L. Carey Battery Park City Authority's (BPCA) financial statement audit for the year ended October 31, 2016. We considered the internal controls within the Information Technology (IT) infrastructure and collected and evaluated evidence of BPCA's information systems, practices, and operations in order to 1) assist the Marks Paneth LLP audit team to gain reliance on the computer controls for an effective and efficient audit process through the validation that information systems are safeguarding assets and maintaining data integrity and 2) provide recommendations as to whether the use of automation is being optimally utilized and operating effectively and efficiently to contribute to BPCA's goals and objectives.

Currently, BPCA has seven (7) physical servers running VMware ESXi version 6.5 and 22 virtual servers running either Microsoft Windows Server version 2012 or VMware ESXi version 6.5. BPCA uses:

- 1. Microsoft's Dynamics GP (Great Plains) version 2013 as its accounting software
- 2. Paramount's WorkPlace version 12.50 for project accounting and procurement
- ADP's SaaS-based (Software as a Service) iPayStatements and E-TIME for payroll processing and time and attendance tracking, respectively
- 4. OpenText eDOCS 5.3.1 and Microsoft Sharepoint for document management

The following observations and recommendations are focused on:

We have concluded no new comments are warranted as a result of our procedures regarding the IT systems, policies, and procedures at BPCA for the 2016 audit year. Management and staff continue to work diligently to maintain an IT environment based on current best practices, including those for network security, oversight, and control of access to financial and critical operation systems, system redundancy, data protection, and business continuity.

CYBERSECURITY

We also considered BPCA's cybersecurity protections and its ability to detect and prevent unauthorized internal and external access to BPCA's network. We looked at the policies and procedures in place to ensure secure processes are maintained, and BPCA staff is informed of current, secure practices. It would be impractical as part of this IT assessment process to provide a full cybersecurity review. Cybersecurity protections at BPCA include:

- 1. A pair of SonicWALL NSA 4500 clustered firewall devices at the BPCA offices
- 2. Symantec's Endpoint Protection version 12.1.5 to protect against malware on workstations and servers
- Spam filtering through US Internet, BPCA' email provider, as well as through their SonicWALL firewall devices
- 4. Onsite and offsite backup of BPCA data and virtual services using QuorumLabs' services
- 5. Penetration testing of the BPCA network performed twice a month by the New York State Office of Information Technology Services
- 6. VMware's AirWatch version 91.4 mobile device management platform for BYOD protection of BPCA -provided portable devices, which includes the ability to delete ("wipe") data on the mobile devices

We were also informed that BPCA has purchased cyber insurance to mitigate losses from a variety of potential cyber incidents, including data breaches, business interruption, and network damage. We strongly recommend that BPCA's Audit Committee, or other appropriate Board Committee members, review the summary of policy provisions to confirm coverage and ensure all necessary precautions for BPCA's business are addressed.

Note: Tailored Technologies is not an insurance expert and, as such, neither opines on the efficacy nor attests to the sufficiency of BPCA's cyber insurance policy.

Exhibit I – Current Year Recommendations

There are no new observations and recommendations for the current year.

END OF NEW RECOMMENDATIONS

Exhibit II – Prior Year Observations Requiring Further Attention

There are no prior year observations and recommendations which require further attention.

** END OF REPEAT RECOMMENDATIONS**

Exhibit III - Prior Year Recommendations That Appear Not to Require Further Action

1. Data Restore Testing

Observation (FY16): We were informed BPCA does not perform periodic, scheduled test restores of backed up data. While user files are restored on an as-needed basis, the restored data, consisting of critical files and systems, is not formally tested. The concern is core financial and critical operational files could become unrecoverable, leaving the ability to restore and recover these files in doubt.

Initial Recommendation: BPCA should consider creating formal policies and procedures requiring the periodic review and testing of backup processes. The policies and procedures should address, at minimum:

- 1. The review of documentation and backup job configurations to ensure the proper capture of all financial and operational data
- 2. The identification of the staff members who are authorized to approve the restore of data
- 3. The identification of staff members who are authorized to access the data backup storage
- 4. The identification of the backup data stores which must be encrypted
- 5. The schedule and scope of each test restore of both onsite and offsite data and verification steps to ensure the backup media is sound, and the data is correct and not corrupt

<u>Files (such as Microsoft Word or Excel files)</u>: for testing the restore process and the integrity of backed up files and documents, we recommend:

- 1. Test restores of files occur at least once a quarter
- 2. IT, Finance, and operational staff prepare a list of critical files to be restored each quarter. We recommend a different list of files for each quarter
- 3. IT staff restore the identified files to a testing environment (either a separate directory or server) and have Finance and or operational staff open and inspect the files
- 4. The results of the test restores be documented and reported to senior management

<u>Applications and Databases</u>: Best practices dictate financial and critical operational applications and databases should be periodically restored to ensure the database can be properly restored should the production equipment fail. We recommend BPCA perform restore testing for all components of the Microsoft Dynamics GP system. Testing should include, at minimum:

- 1. Identification of a set of key reports by the business process owner; the reports should be generated by the production application immediately before backing up the application database
- 2. A restore of the application database from backup to a physical or virtual recovery server. This should be performed for both onsite and offsite backups
- 3. The business process owner should run a set of key reports from the restored database and compare with the production reports to ensure the accuracy of the backed up / recovered data

FY16 Corrective Action Taken: We were provided with an updated copy of BPCA's "Managed Information System Policy" which includes an updated Data Restore section that requires quarterly testing of BPCA's user data and applications on a quarterly basis for disaster recovery purposes.

END